



To: SUNY University Faculty Senate
From: Executive Committee
RE: Executive Budget Resolution
Date: 192nd Plenary, October 20-22, 2022
Location: SUNY Purchase
Resolution #: 192-04-1
Vote: For: 43 / Against: 0

RATIONALE:

WHEREAS Governor Kathy Hochul has already demonstrated how well she understands that in fulfilling their core academic missions, the State University of New York (SUNY) and the City University of New York (CUNY) transform students' lives and life chances and serve New York State (NYS) as anchors of community, foundations for democracy, platforms for civic engagement, engines of economic development, pathways to the middle class and beyond, magnets for population growth and private investment, and generators of health, creativity, and innovation¹; and

WHEREAS the State University of New York University Faculty Senate (SUNY UFS) Executive Committee thanked Governor Hochul in February 2022 for “proposing the best Executive Budget for public higher education in New York State since before the Great Recession²” and for outlining in her State of the State Address a “vision to make SUNY the best statewide public higher education system in the nation”; and

WHEREAS SUNY UFS welcomes and applauds the FY23 Enacted Budget’s immediate closing of the gap between SUNY tuition and the maximum available awards through the Tuition Assistance Program (TAP) and Excelsior Scholarship, cancellation of a \$67.5M SUNY hospital revenue sweep, increased operating funds for SUNY and CUNY, increased support for educational opportunity programs and centers, expanded eligibility for the Tuition Assistance Program (TAP), and increased investments in and access to SUNY child care centers; and

WHEREAS Governor Hochul has a historic opportunity in her FY24 Executive Budget to make a bigger difference in the future of SUNY and CUNY than any previous NYS governor, including Governor Rockefeller, by making NYS a national leader in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY’s core academic missions; and

WHEREAS SUNY and CUNY have not fully recovered from either the Great Recession or the COVID-19 pandemic, Federal pandemic relief funds will soon be exhausted, CUNY senior colleges suffered a 21% reduction in inflation-adjusted full-time student equivalent (FTE) state investment between 2008 and 2020, SUNY lost \$4.2B in inflation-adjusted operating budget state support between FY09 and FY22, and a number of SUNY campuses need more faculty with expertise in diversity, equity, inclusion, and social justice to design and teach required courses in the new SUNY General Education (SUNY GE) program starting in Fall 2023²; and

WHEREAS SUNY UFS has worked closely for many years with the SUNY Faculty Council of Community Colleges (SUNY FCCC) and the CUNY University Faculty Senate (CUNY UFS), and in alliance with the SUNY Student Assembly (SUNY SA), United University Professions (UUP), and the CUNY Professional Staff Congress (PSC-CUNY) in advocating for NYS to become a national leader in investing direct state aid in SUNY and CUNY’s core operating budgets³;

RESOLUTION:

THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY University Faculty Senate (SUNY UFS) empowers President Landa to work with SUNY System Administration on Executive Budget research and advocacy with Governor Hochul and her staff and to coordinate efforts with CUNY University Faculty Senate and CUNY System Administration leadership; and

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY UFS urges Governor Hochul to craft an FY24 Executive Budget that makes New York State a national leader in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY's core academic missions by

- significantly decreasing the share of SUNY and CUNY core operating costs paid for by student tuition and fees by increasing the share of public funds going to public higher education core operating budgets, through such means as
 - fully funding all negotiated contractual increases;
 - fully funding debt service, fringe benefits, and mandatory operating cost increases for *all* SUNY and CUNY institutions, including SUNY hospitals, thereby fully committing New York State to a robust maintenance of effort for SUNY and CUNY;
 - making *all* SUNY and CUNY institutions whole for the cuts in direct state aid to their operating budgets since the Great Recession, including SUNY hospitals for the withdrawal of mission funding that predates the Great Recession;
 - committing to covering more of the current costs of running degree programs and general education programs on every SUNY and CUNY campus through direct state operating aid;
- fully funding requests by the SUNY and CUNY Boards of Trustees for both operating funds and five-year capital plans addressing critical maintenance and new capital projects, as well as necessary accessibility upgrades to older buildings; and

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY UFS calls on Governor Hochul to include in the Executive Budget Book a comprehensive longitudinal examination of and a projection of how the FY24 Executive Budget would impact the following standard measures of the fiscal health of public higher education in NYS:

- SUNY's and CUNY's shares of NYS's general fund;
- NYS general fund shares of SUNY's and CUNY's core operating budgets;
- Ratio of student share (net tuition) to state share (direct state aid) that pays for SUNY's and CUNY's core operating budgets;
- Appropriations of NYS general funds for operating expenses of SUNY and CUNY:
 - per student FTE
 - per \$1,000 of personal income in NYS
 - per capita in NYS;
- How the following patterns vary across SUNY and CUNY campuses and sectors:
 - the number of tenure-eligible, full-time contingent, and part-time contingent faculty per 1,000 students
 - expenditures per student per campus, and per student per campus unit (e.g., college, school)
 - total state appropriations and tuition revenue per campus
 - the demographic breakdown by race, ethnicity, gender, and socioeconomic status on each campus; and

FURTHER BE IT RESOLVED that SUNY UFS calls on all SUNY campus governance bodies, along with all friends and all other good-faith partners of SUNY and CUNY, to speedily pass resolutions aligned with ours, and in those resolutions to encourage their constituencies, in their capacity as citizens or residents of New York and/or supporters of public higher education, to urge Governor Hochul to make New York State a national leader in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY’s core academic missions.

BACKGROUND:

1. According to a November 2018 Rockefeller Institute report, SUNY’s economic impact is \$28.6 billion (\$6.83 billion in Long Island, \$4.37 billion in Western NY, \$3.94 billion in Central NY, \$3.43 billion in the Capitol Region, \$2.98 billion in the Southern Tier, \$2.53 billion in New York City, \$1.6 billion in the Hudson Valley, \$1.32 billion in the Finger Lakes, \$.82 billion in the Mohawk Valley, and \$.78 billion in the North Country); every dollar invested in SUNY returns \$8.17; and 78 percent of SUNY’s 633,000 bachelor’s degree graduates in 2006 worked in New York two years after graduation and 64 percent remained in the state eight years later.

According to higher education scholars Walter McMahon and Christopher Newfield, decision-makers consistently underestimate higher education’s private non-market goods (on one’s health, longevity, happiness, human capital, working conditions, job type and benefits, control over consumption, savings, and family size, and children’s education and cognitive development), indirect private market benefits, nonmarket private benefits (both direct and indirect), and social goods (both direct and indirect), leading to an overemphasis on the “personal monetary benefit of a college degree,” although this is really “only about one-third” of its “overall value” (Newfield 71). See also State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *Investigating the Impacts of State Higher Education Appropriations and Financial Aid*.

2. We are using the common technical starting and ending points for the Great Recession (December 2007-June 2009); New York State cut direct state aid to SUNY FY10-FY14 and it has remained roughly flat in pre-inflation dollars since then. See Bowen; State University of New York University Faculty Senate Executive Committee; State University of New York University Faculty Senate, “Successful Implementation of the SUNY General Education Category ‘Diversity: Equity, Inclusion, and Social Justice.’” For further context on the national trend toward long-term disinvestment in the mission and core operating budgets of public colleges and universities by state governments, along with ideas for reversing it, see Benton; Crisp, McClure, and Orphan; Eaton; Fabricant and Brier; Hamilton and Nielsen; Isserles; Newfield; Taylor; Taylor and Cantwell; Third Way. For SUNY’s own reporting, see State University of New York.

3. See, for instance, the joint statement from the Executive Committees of SUNY UFS, SUNY FCCC, and CUNY UFS from January 2016, “Invest in CUNY and SUNY,” SUNY UFS’s January 2019 “New Deal for SUNY and CUNY” resolution, SUNY UFS’s January 2020 “SUNY/CUNY Budget” resolution, and SUNY UFS’s October 2021 “Executive Budget Resolution.”

Tables 1-3 on pages 4-6 provide evidence that New York State has a ways to go to become a national leader in sustainably and equitably supporting and advancing SUNY and CUNY’s core academic missions.

Table 1. New York State’s Tax Appropriations and Rank among States of State Tax Funds for Operating Expenses of Public and Private Higher Education per \$1,000 Personal Income and per Capita, 2008, 2014-2022

Fiscal Year	Appropriations/\$1K	Rank	Appropriations/capita	Rank
2008	\$5.70	38	\$266.17	23
2014	\$4.92	37	\$269.98	20
2015	\$5.00	32	\$281.37	16
2016	\$4.85	34	\$286.96	19
2017	\$4.84	34	\$292.07	20
2018	\$4.66	34	\$302.76	16
2019	\$4.60	34	\$314.58	16
2020	\$4.53	37	\$315.45	18
2021	\$3.86	35	\$287.66	19
2022	\$3.96	40	\$300.45	22

Source: Grapevine

What good reason can there be for NYS to never have been inside the top 30 in appropriations per thousand dollars of personal income or the top 15 in appropriations per capita?

Clearly, as a large, wealthy state, NYS has the capacity to become a true national leader; it is up to Governor Hochul to make us one.

Table 2. New York State’s Rank among States on State Support (mostly actual tax revenues and lottery profits) in Constant Adjusted Dollars for Operating Expenses of Public Higher Education per \$1,000 Personal Income, per Capita, per Student FTE, as Share of Total State Revenues, on Student Share (net tuition revenue as a percentage of total state revenue), and on State Public Financial Aid per Student FTE, 1980, 2001, 2008-2021

Fiscal Year	Support /\$1K (rank)	Support /capita (rank)	Support/FTE (rank)	State Allocation (rank)	Student Share (rank)	Aid/FTE (rank)
1980	7.73 (34)	267 (25)	11,835 (9)	5.7% (44)	19.6% (16)	
2001	5.17 (44)	281 (38)	11,616 (20)	3.8% (48)	29.7% (23)	1,944 (1)
2008	5.90 (36)	343 (27)	11,898 (15)	3.9% (45)	30.0% (13)	1,970 (3)
2009	6.38 (35)	364 (19)	11,960 (9)	4.2% (45)	30.2% (12)	1,930 (4)
2010	5.94 (32)	345 (20)	11,250 (9)	4.1% (44)	32.5% (14)	2,005 (4)
2011	5.66 (32)	335 (20)	11,092 (7)	3.8% (44)	32.5% (11)	1,844 (4)
2012	5.27 (30)	321 (20)	10,140 (8)	3.6% (44)	35.5% (9)	1,972 (3)
2013	5.46 (29)	331 (16)	10,571 (8)	3.6% (44)	35.7% (9)	1,948 (3)
2014	5.43 (29)	337 (16)	10,808 (7)	3.6% (44)	36.1% (9)	1,920 (3)
2015	5.42 (29)	350 (15)	11,114 (7)	3.6% (44)	35.7% (10)	1,974 (3)
2016	5.33 (30)	352 (14)	11,275 (6)	3.5% (45)	36.6% (9)	1,955 (5)
2017	5.16 (32)	358 (14)	11,419 (7)	3.7% (44)	35.7% (10)	1,906 (4)
2018	5.16 (28)	365 (11)	11,655 (6)	3.5% (44)	33.4% (8)	2,004 (5)
2019	5.10 (28)	371 (12)	11,900 (6)	3.5% (44)	33.0% (8)	1,978 (6)
2020	4.89 (29)	369 (13)	12,014 (8)		32.9% (10)	1,920 (7)
2021			11,735 (12)		31.7% (10)	1,703 (9)

Source: State Higher Education Executive Officers Association (SHEEO)

Since the Great Recession, NYS has drastically reduced its support for SUNY and CUNY per thousand dollars of personal income and cut its allocation as a percentage of total state revenues, a clear reduction in effort relative to capacity. (The main reason its rankings have generally held steady or improved during that time period is that other states have made even deeper cuts.) Even marginal improvements in columns 2 and 5 would give NYS an excellent opportunity to become a national leader in columns 3, 4, 6, and 7.

How have these kinds of funding decisions affected student debt in NYS?

Table 3. Student Debt, by United States Average, New York State Average and Rank, Percentage of New York State Students Graduating with Debt and Rank, New York State Public Four-Year Average, and Percentage of New York State Public Four-Year Students Graduating with Debt, 2008-2019

Grad Year	US ave	NY ave (rank)*	NY %age (rank)*	NY 4Y Public ave	NY 4Y Public %age
2008	\$21,167	\$23,580	62%	\$18,026	56%
2009	\$22,522	\$25,590	63%	\$20,911	56%
2010	\$23,540	\$26,360	61%	\$21,706	55%
2011	\$24,854	\$25,764 (19)	60% (25)	\$20,561	54%
2012	\$25,903	\$25,686 (27)	60% (23)	\$20,875	55%
2013	\$26,406	\$26,371 (25)	60% (26)	\$21,720	55%
2014	\$27,052	\$27,822 (19)	61% (25)	\$23,774	53%
2015	\$27,992	\$29,320 (18)	59% (31)	\$24,307	52%
2016	\$28,711	\$30,303 (15)	58% (27)	\$25,967	58%
2017	\$29,000	\$30,931 (13)	60% (15)	\$26,380	54%
2018	\$29,200	\$31,127 (15)	59% (17)	\$26,456	56%
2019	\$28,950	\$31,155 (16)	58% (22)	\$26,674	55%

Source: The Institute for College Access and Success, College Insight

*Ranked from highest to lowest in student debt and percentage of students graduating with debt; that is, it's better to be closer to #50 than #1 in this ranking.

For more on student debt, inequality, and inequities, see Backstrom; Espinosa, Turk, Taylor, and Chessman; Schirmer, Wozniak, Morrison, Gonsalves, and Levy; State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *Investigating the Impacts of State Higher Education Appropriations and Financial Aid*; Taylor, Turk, Chessman, and Espinosa.

Imagine the possibilities for student access and success if Governor Hochul were to lead an ambitious effort to significantly reduce average student indebtedness and the share of indebted students in SUNY and CUNY.

SOURCES AND REFERENCES

Backstrom, Brian, *A Deeper Look at Student Loan Debt in New York State*, Rockefeller Institute of Government, <https://rockinst.org/blog/a-deeper-look-at-student-loan-debt-in-new-york-state/>, November 2018. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Benton, Ned, "The Faculty Gap: Comparison of SUNY and CUNY Senior College Faculty/Student Ratios," <https://ufsbac.commons.gc.cuny.edu/wp-content/blogs.dir/11465/files/2021/10/FacultyGap.pdf>, September 2021. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Bowen, Barbara, "Testimony of the Professional Staff Congress/CUNY: Executive Budget, the City University of New York, FY2021," https://2022.psc-cuny.org/sites/default/files/PSCTestimonyExecBudgetFY2021_Web.pdf, February 2020. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Clark, John, W. Bruce Leslie, and Kenneth O'Brien, eds., *SUNY at Sixty: The Promise of the State University of New York* (SUNY P, 2010).

Crisp, Gloria, Kevin McClure, and Cecilia Orphan, eds., *Unlocking Opportunity through Broadly Accessible Institutions* (Routledge, 2022).

Drescher, Nuala, William Scheuerman, and Ivan Steen, *United University Professions: Pioneering in Higher Education Unionism* (SUNY P, 2019).

Eaton, Charlie, *Bankers in the Ivory Tower* (U of Chicago P, 2022).

Espinosa, Lorelle, Jonathan Turk, Morgan Taylor, and Hollie Chessman, *Race and Ethnicity in Higher Education: A Status Report* (American Council on Education, 2019), <https://1xfsu31b52d33idlp13twtos-wpengine.netdna-ssl.com/wp-content/uploads/2019/02/Race-and-Ethnicity-in-Higher-Education.pdf>. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Executive Committees of State University of New York University Faculty Senate, State University of New York Faculty Council of Community Colleges, and City University of New York University Faculty Senate, "Invest in CUNY and SUNY," https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/fccc/position-statements/InvestSUNY_CUNY_Jan2016.pdf, January 2016. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Fabricant, Michael, and Stephen Brier, *Austerity Blues: Fighting for the Soul of Public Higher Education* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2016).

Grapevine, Illinois State University, <https://education.illinoisstate.edu/grapevine/>. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Hamilton, Laura, and Kelly Nielsen, *Broke: The Racial Consequences of Underfunding Public Universities* (U of Chicago P, 2021).

The Institute for College Access and Success, College Insight, <https://college-insight.org/>. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Isserles, Robin, *The Costs of Completion: Student Success in Community College* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2021).

McMahon, Walter, *Higher Learning, Greater Good: The Private and Social Benefits of Higher Education* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2009).

Newfield, Christopher, *The Great Mistake: How We Wrecked Public Universities and How We Can Fix Them* (Johns Hopkins UP, 2016).

Schirmer, Eleni, Jason Wozniak, Dana Morrison, Joanna Gonsalves, and Rich Levy, “Making the Invisible Visible: Organizing against the Instructionally Harmful, Antidemocratic Effects of Institutional Debt,” *Journal of Academic Freedom* 12 (2021).

Schultz, Lara, *The Economic Impact of the State University of New York*, Rockefeller Institute of Government, <https://rockinst.org/issue-area/the-economic-impact-of-the-state-university-of-new-york/>, November 2018. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *A Federal-State Partnership for True College Affordability*, https://sheeo.org/wp-content/uploads/2019/03/Federal-State_Partnership_for_True_College_Affordability.pdf, June 2017. Accessed 11 October 2022.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *Investigating the Impacts of State Higher Education Appropriations and Financial Aid*, https://sheeo.org/wp-content/uploads/2021/05/SHEEO_ImpactAppropationsFinancialAid.pdf, May 2021. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *SHEF: State Higher Education Finance*, <https://sheemain.wpengine.com/project/state-higher-education-finance/>, 2010-2022. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State Higher Education Executive Officers Association, *State Effort and Capacity to Support Higher Education, FY 2019 and 2020*, <https://shef.sheeo.org/state-effort/>, 2022. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State University of New York, *Financial Fact Book for the June 30, 2021 Fiscal Year*.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate. “Advancement of Historically Underrepresented Faculty.” http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/190-01-1_advancement_of_historically_underrepresented_faculty.pdf, January 2022. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, “Executive Budget Resolution,” http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/189-02-1_comm_executive_budget_resolution.pdf, October 2021. Accessed 11 October 2022.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, “New Deal for SUNY and CUNY,” <https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/faculty-senate/plenary/181-03-01.pdf>, January 2019. Accessed 11 October 2022.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, “SUNY/CUNY Budget,” https://system.suny.edu/media/suny/content-assets/documents/faculty-senate/plenary/184-01-01_exec_suny_cuny_budget.pdf, January 2020. Accessed 11 October 2022.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate Executive Committee, “Statement on the Executive Budget,” http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/ufs_ec_statement_on_executive_budget__2_22_2022_.pdf, February 2022. Accessed 10 October 2022.

State University of New York University Faculty Senate, “Successful Implementation of the SUNY General Education Category ‘Diversity: Equity, Inclusion, and Social Justice,’” http://www.sunyufs.us/uploads/1/1/6/9/116933050/190-02-1_successful_implementation_of_the_suny_general_education_diversity_category.pdf, January 2022. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Taylor, Barrett, *Wrecked: Deinstitutionalization and Partial Defenses in State Higher Education Policy* (Rutgers UP, 2022).

Taylor, Barrett, and Brendan Cantwell, *Unequal Higher Education: Wealth, Status, and Student Opportunity* (Rutgers UP, 2019).

Taylor, Morgan, Jonathan Turk, Hollie Chessman, and Lorelle Espinosa, *Race and Ethnicity in Higher Education: 2020 Supplement* (American Council on Education, 2020), <https://www.equityinhighered.org/resources/report-downloads/race-and-ethnicity-in-higher-education-2020-supplement/>. Accessed 10 October 2022.

Third Way, *Why Rich Colleges Get Richer & Poor Colleges Get Poorer: The Case for Equity-Based Funding in Higher Education*, <https://www.thirdway.org/report/why-rich-colleges-get-richer-poor-colleges-get-poorer-the-case-for-equity-based-funding-in-higher-education>, November 2020. Accessed 11 October 2022.

United University Professions, “NY25: A Vision for SUNY and New York,” <https://uupinfo.org/NY25/>, December 2019. Accessed 10 October 2022.

United University Professions, “NY HEALS,” <https://uupinfo.org/resources/nyheals/>, December 2020. Accessed 10 October 2022.

United University Professions, “Restore Opportunity, Restore SUNY,” <https://uupinfo.org/legislation/pdf/UUP22StateLegAgenda.pdf>. Accessed 10 October 2022.